# An improved multiplicity bound for eigenvalues of the clamped disk

Dan Mangoubi and Daniel Rosenblatt

#### Abstract

We prove that no eigenvalue of the clamped disk has multiplicity greater than four. This improves upon a previous bound. Exploiting a linear recursion formula of order two for cross-product Bessel functions in which the coefficients are non-rational functions satisfying a non-linear algebraic recursion, we show that higher multiplicity eigenvalues must be algebraic, in contradiction with the Siegel-Shidlovskii theory.

### 1 Introduction and background

#### 1.1 The vibrating clamped plate

In this paper we are concerned with the vibrating clamped circular plate [\[1,](#page-5-0) ch. V§6], that is, the fourth order eigenvalue problem

(VP) 
$$
\begin{cases} \Delta^2 u = \lambda u & \text{in } \mathbb{D}, \\ u = 0 & \text{on } \partial \mathbb{D}, \\ \partial_n u = 0 & \text{on } \partial \mathbb{D}. \end{cases}
$$

where  $\Delta = \text{div} \circ \text{grad}$  is the Laplacian. A basis of eigenfunctions is given in polar coordinates by the family

$$
u_{m,k}(r,\phi) = (I_m(w_{m,k})J_m(w_{m,k}r) - J_m(w_{m,k})J_m(w_{m,k}r))e^{im\phi}
$$

with corresponding eignevalues  $\lambda = w_{m,k}^4$ , where  $J_m, I_m$  denote the Bessel and modified Bessel functions respectively of the first kind, and  $w_{m,k}$  is a zero of the cross product

<span id="page-0-0"></span>
$$
W_m := I_{m+1}J_m + I_mJ_{m+1} = I_{m-1}J_m - I_mJ_{m-1} . \tag{1}
$$

We are interested to know whether non-trivial multiplicities occur in the spectrum. The analogous problem for the vibrating circular membrane was solved in [\[3\]](#page-6-0) (see also [\[4](#page-6-1), [5,](#page-6-2) ch. 15.28]). The problem amounts to the question whether there exist  $m_1, m_2 \in \mathbb{N}_0$ distinct and  $x_0 > 0$  with  $W_{m_1}(x_0) = W_{m_2}(x_0) = 0$ . However, this seems to be a difficult open problem. In [\[2\]](#page-6-3) it was shown that there do not exist  $m_1, m_2, m_3, m_4 \in \mathbb{N}_0$  pairwise distinct and  $x_0 > 0$  for which  $W_{m_1}(x_0) = W_{m_2}(x_0) = W_{m_3}(x_0) = W_{m_4}(x_0) = 0$ . The proof was based on a *fourth* order recursion formula for the sequence  $W_m$  with rational functions as coefficients. The aim of this paper is to prove

<span id="page-1-0"></span>**Theorem 1.1.** There do not exist  $m_1, m_2, m_3 \in \mathbb{N}_0$  pairwise distinct and  $x_0 > 0$  such that  $W_{m_1}(x_0) = W_{m_2}(x_0) = W_{m_3}(x_0) = 0.$ 

As a corollary we obtain

**Corollary 1.2.** Let  $\lambda$  be an eigenvalue of the vibrating clamped disk problem. Then,  $\lambda$  is of multiplicity four at most.

To prove Theorem [1.1](#page-1-0) we show that if  $m_1, m_2, m_3 \in \mathbb{N}_0$  pairwise distinct and  $x_0 > 0$ with  $W_{m_1}(x_0) = W_{m_2}(x_0) = W_{m_3}(x_0) = 0$  exist, then  $x_0$  must be algebraic. However, an immediate application of the Siegel-Shidlovskii theory shows that any positive root of the equation  $W_m(x_0) = 0$  is transcendental. The main new ingredient in our proof with respect to [\[2](#page-6-3)], is a second order linear recursion for the sequence  $W_m$ , whose coefficients, while not rational, satisfy an algebraic *non-linear* recursion of degree two. At a first step we show that each joint zero  $x_0$  of  $W_m$  and  $W_{m'}$  leads to an equation of the form

<span id="page-1-1"></span>
$$
P_{m,m'}(x_0, f(x_0)) = 0
$$
\n(2)

where  $P_{m,m'}(x, y)$  is a polynomial of degree two with respect to y and f is a transcendental function. At a second step we prove that it is possible to eliminate  $f$  from a system of any two such equations, leading to a non-trivial polynomial equation for  $x_0$ .

#### 1.2 Acknowledgments

We are very grateful to Gal Binyamini, suggesting the possibility of eliminating  $f$  from our equations [\(2\)](#page-1-1). We thank Or Kuperman for helpful discussions regarding the second order recurrence satisfied by the sequence  $W_m$ .

### 2 Bessel functions and their quotients

Let m be an integer. The Bessel function  $J_m$  can be defined as the power series

$$
J_m(x) = \left(\frac{x}{2}\right)^m \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \frac{(-1)^k}{k! \Gamma(m+k+1)} \left(\frac{x}{2}\right)^{2k}
$$

The modified Bessel function  $I_m$  is the power series

$$
I_m(x) = \left(\frac{x}{2}\right)^m \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \frac{1}{k! \Gamma(m+k+1)} \left(\frac{x}{2}\right)^{2k}
$$

<span id="page-1-2"></span>Proposition 2.1. [\[5](#page-6-2), chs. 2.12, 3.71] The following recursions are satisfied.

$$
J_{m+1} = \frac{2m}{x} J_m - J_{m-1}
$$

$$
I_{m+1} = -\frac{2m}{x} I_m + I_{m-1}
$$

We will consider quotients of successive modified Bessel functions.

Definition 2.2. For  $x \in \mathbb{R}$  we set

$$
F_m(x) := \frac{I_m(x)}{xI_{m-1}(x)}.
$$

The following identity, which can be viewed as a discrete Riccati equation will be important in the sequel.

#### <span id="page-2-1"></span>Key Identity 2.3.

$$
x^2 F_{m+1}(x) F_m(x) = 1 - 2m F_m(x)
$$

*Proof.* From the definition of  $F_m$  and Proposition [2.1](#page-1-2) we have

$$
x^{2}F_{m+1}F_{m} = x^{2} \cdot \frac{I_{m+1}}{xI_{m}} \cdot \frac{I_{m}}{xI_{m-1}} = \frac{1}{I_{m-1}} \left( I_{m-1} - \frac{2m}{x} I_{m} \right) = 1 - 2mF_{m} .
$$

 $\Box$ 

 $\Box$ 

A similar computation, which we omit, shows also

<span id="page-2-2"></span>Lemma 2.4.  $x^2 F_{-m+1} = x^2 F_{m+1} + 2m$ 

## 3 Second order recursion for cross products of Bessel functions

The sequence  $(W_m)_{m\in\mathbb{Z}}$  satisfies a fourth order linear recurrence with non-constant coefficients in  $\mathbb{Q}(x)$  (see [\[2\]](#page-6-3)). However, it also satisfies a second order linear recurrence whose coefficients, while not in  $\mathbb{Q}(x)$ , satisfy themselves a quadratic recursion. We prove

<span id="page-2-0"></span>Theorem 3.1. The following recursion formula holds.

$$
W_{m+1} = 2mF_mW_m + (2mF_m - 1)W_{m-1}
$$

Proof. On the one hand we have by [\(1\)](#page-0-0) and Proposition [2.1](#page-1-2)

$$
W_{m-1} + W_{m+1} = (I_m J_{m-1} + I_{m-1} J_m) + (I_m J_{m+1} - I_{m+1} J_m)
$$
  
=  $I_m \frac{2m}{x} J_m + \frac{2m}{x} I_m J_m = \frac{4m}{x} I_m J_m$ .

On the other hand,

$$
2mF_m(W_m + W_{m-1}) = 2m\frac{I_m}{xI_{m-1}}(I_{m-1}J_m - I_mJ_{m-1} + I_mJ_{m-1} + I_{m-1}J_m) = \frac{4m}{x}I_mJ_m.
$$

Comparing the preceding expressions gives the desired identity.

### 4 Rolling out the recursion

In this section we use the second order recursion for  $W_m$  (Theorem [3.1\)](#page-2-0) in order to express any element in the sequence in terms of two initial consecutive terms.

<span id="page-3-0"></span>**Proposition 4.1.** Let  $m \in \mathbb{Z}$ ,  $n \in \mathbb{N}_0$ . There exist polynomials  $A_{m,n}$ ,  $B_{m,n}$ ,  $\tilde{B}_{m,n}$ ,  $C_{m,n} \in \mathbb{Q}[x]$  such that:

$$
x^{2n}W_{m+n+1} = \left(A_{m,n}F_m + x^2B_{m,n} + C_{m,n}F_m^{-1}\right)W_m +
$$
  

$$
\left(A_{m,n}F_m + \tilde{B}_{m,n} - C_{m,n}F_m^{-1}\right)W_{m-1}
$$
\n(3)

**Remark.** Note that the coefficients in the preceding formula are linear in  $F_m$  and  $F_m^{-1}$ .

*Proof.* The case  $n = 0$  follows from Theorem [3.1.](#page-2-0) For  $n \geq 1$ 

$$
x^{2n}W_{m+n+1} = x^{2}x^{2n-2}W_{(m+1)+(n-1)+1} =
$$
  
\n
$$
(x^{2}A_{m+1,n-1}F_{m+1} + x^{4}B_{m+1,n-1} + x^{2}C_{m+1,n-1}F_{m+1}^{-1})W_{m+1}
$$
  
\n
$$
+ \left(x^{2}A_{m+1,n-1}F_{m+1} + x^{2}\tilde{B}_{m+1,n-1} - x^{2}C_{m+1,n-1}F_{m+1}^{-1}\right)W_{m}
$$

We substitute  $W_{m+1}$  using Theorem [3.1](#page-2-0) and Key Identity [2.3.](#page-2-1)

$$
x^{2n}W_{m+n+1} =
$$
  
\n
$$
(2mx^{2}A_{m+1,n-1}F_{m}F_{m+1} + 2mx^{4}B_{m+1,n-1}F_{m} + 2mx^{2}C_{m+1,n-1}F_{m}F_{m+1}^{-1})W_{m}
$$
  
\n
$$
-(x^{2}A_{m+1,n-1}F_{m+1} + x^{4}B_{m+1,n-1} + x^{2}C_{m+1,n-1}F_{m+1}^{-1})x^{2}F_{m}F_{m+1}W_{m-1}
$$
  
\n
$$
+ (x^{2}A_{m+1,n-1}F_{m+1} + x^{2}\tilde{B}_{m+1,n-1} - x^{2}C_{m+1,n-1}F_{m+1}^{-1})W_{m}
$$

Applying Key Identity [2.3](#page-2-1) and collecting terms gives

$$
x^{2n}W_{m+n+1} =
$$
  
\n
$$
\left(2mA_{m+1,n-1}(1 - 2mF_m) + 2mx^4B_{m+1,n-1}F_m - x^2C_{m+1,n-1}(1 - 2mF_m)F_{m+1}^{-1} + A_{m+1,n-1}(F_m^{-1} - 2m) + x^2\tilde{B}_{m+1,n-1}\right)W_m
$$
  
\n
$$
-(x^2A_{m+1,n-1}F_{m+1}(1 - 2mF_m) + x^4B_{m+1,n-1}(1 - 2mF_m) + x^4C_{m+1,n-1}F_m)W_{m-1}
$$

Applying once more Key Identity [2.3](#page-2-1) and collecting terms gives

$$
x^{2n}W_{m+n+1} =
$$
  
\n
$$
\left((-4m^2A_{m+1,n-1} + 2mx^4B_{m+1,n-1} - x^4C_{m+1,n-1})F_m + x^2\tilde{B}_{m+1,n-1} + A_{m+1,n-1}F_m^{-1}\right)W_m
$$
  
\n
$$
+\left(2mA_{m+1,n-1}(1 - 2mF_m) - A_{m+1,n-1}(F_m^{-1} - 2m) + \left(2mx^4B_{m+1,n-1} - x^4C_{m+1,n-1}\right)F_m - x^4B_{m+1,n-1}\right)W_{m-1}
$$

and finally,

$$
x^{2n}W_{m+n+1} =
$$
  
\n
$$
\left((-4m^2A_{m+1,n-1} + 2mx^4B_{m+1,n-1} - x^4C_{m+1,n-1})F_m + x^2\tilde{B}_{m+1,n-1} + A_{m+1,n-1}F_m^{-1}\right)W_m
$$
  
\n
$$
+\left((-4m^2A_{m+1,n-1} + 2mx^4B_{m+1,n-1} - x^4C_{m+1,n-1})F_m + 4mA_{m+1,n-1} - x^4B_{m+1,n-1} - A_{m+1,n-1}F_m^{-1}\right)W_{m-1}
$$

which is of the desired form.

<span id="page-4-0"></span>As an immediate consequence of the above computation we obtain the following Lemma.

<span id="page-4-1"></span>**Lemma 4.2.** Let  $A_{m,n}$ ,  $B_{m,n}$ ,  $B_{m,n}$ , and  $C_{m,n}$  be as in Proposition [4.1.](#page-3-0) Then, the following recursive relations hold.

(i)  $A_{m,0} = 2m$ ,  $A_{m,n} = -4m^2 A_{m+1,n-1} + 2mx^4 B_{m+1,n-1} - x^4 C_{m+1,n-1}$ 

(*ii*) 
$$
B_{m,0} = 0
$$
,  $B_{m,n} = \tilde{B}_{m+1,n-1}$ 

- (iii)  $\tilde{B}_{m,0} = -1$ ,  $\tilde{B}_{m,n} = 4mA_{m+1,n-1} x^4B_{m+1,n-1}$
- (iv)  $C_{m,0} = 0$ ,  $C_{m,n} = A_{m+1,n-1}$

As a corollary we have

<span id="page-4-3"></span>Lemma 4.3. Let  $m \in \mathbb{Z}$  and  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ . Then,

$$
A_{m,n} \equiv 2(-4)^n (m+n) \prod_{k=0}^{n-1} (m+k)^2 \mod x^4.
$$

In particular, if  $m > 0$  or  $m < -n$ , then  $A_{m,n} \not\equiv 0 \mod x$ .

Proof. The proof follows immediately from Lemma [4.2,](#page-4-0) part [\(i\).](#page-4-1)

 $\Box$ 

### 5 Proof of Theorem [1.1](#page-1-0)

<span id="page-4-2"></span>We recall

**Proposition 5.1** ([\[2\]](#page-6-3)). The functions  $W_m$  and  $W_{m+1}$  have no joint positive zeros. *Proof.* Assume  $W_m(x_0) = W_{m+1}(x_0) = 0$  for some  $x_0 > 0$ . Observe that

$$
W_{m+1} + W_m = I_m J_{m+1} - I_{m+1} J_m + I_{m+1} J_m + I_m J_{m+1} = 2I_m J_{m+1}
$$

and

$$
W_{m+1} - W_m = I_m J_{m+1} - I_{m+1} J_m - I_{m+1} J_m - I_m J_{m+1} = -2I_{m+1} J_m
$$

It follows that  $J_m(x_0) = J_{m+1}(x_0) = 0$ . However, this is impossible since it would imply that  $J'_m(x_0) = (m/x_0)J_m(x_0) - J_{m+1}(x_0)$  is also zero, while  $J_m$  satisfies a second order linear ODE.  $\Box$  A direct consequence of the preceding proposition and Proposition [4.1](#page-3-0) is

<span id="page-5-3"></span><span id="page-5-1"></span>Corollary 5.2. Let  $m \in \mathbb{Z}$ , and  $n \in \mathbb{N}_0$ .

(a) If  $x_0$  is a joint zero of  $W_m$ , and  $W_{m+n+2}$ , then

$$
A_{m+1,n}(x_0)F_{m+1}(x_0)^2 + x_0^2 B_{m+1,n}(x_0)F_{m+1}(x_0) + C_{m+1,n}(x_0) = 0
$$

<span id="page-5-2"></span>(b) If  $x_0$  is a joint zero of  $W_m$ , and  $W_{m-n-2}$ , then

$$
A_{-m+1,n}(x_0) (x_0^2 F_{m+1}(x_0) + 2m)^2
$$
  
+  $x_0^4 B_{-m+1,n}(x_0) (x_0^2 F_{m+1}(x_0) + 2m) + x_0^4 C_{-m+1,n}(x_0) = 0$ 

*Proof.* Part [\(a\)](#page-5-1) follows from Proposition [4.1](#page-3-0) with m replaced by  $m + 1$ , taking into account Proposition [5.1.](#page-4-2) Part [\(b\)](#page-5-2) follows from Part [\(a\)](#page-5-1) with m replaced by  $-m$ , taking into account Lemma [2.4.](#page-2-2)  $\Box$ 

*Proof of Theorem [1.1.](#page-1-0)* Assume  $0 \le m_1 < m_2 < m_3$  and  $x_0 > 0$  are such that  $W_{m_1}(x_0) =$  $W_{m_2}(x_0) = W_{m_3}(x_0) = 0$ . By Proposition [5.1](#page-4-2) we can write  $m_1 = m_2 - l - 2$ ,  $m_2 = m$  and  $m_3 = m_2 + n + 2$  with  $l, m, n \in \mathbb{N}_0$ . By Corollary [5.2](#page-5-3) setting  $x = x_0$  solves a system

<span id="page-5-4"></span>
$$
\begin{cases} A_{m+1,n}(x)F_{m+1}(x)^{2} + x^{2}B_{m+1,n}(x)F_{m+1}(x) + C_{m+1,n}(x) = 0\\ A_{-m+1,l}(x)\left(x^{2}F_{m+1}(x) + 2m\right)^{2} + x^{4}B_{-m+1,n}(x)\left(x^{2}F_{m+1}(x) + 2m\right) + x^{4}C_{-m+1,n}(x) = 0 \end{cases} \tag{4}
$$

Eliminating  $F_{m+1}^2$  from the preceding system we obtain that  $x_0$  is a root of an equation of the form

$$
(4mA_{m+1,n}(x)A_{-m+1,l}(x) + x^4P_1(x))x^2F_{m+1}(x) + 4m^2A_{m+1,n}(x)A_{-m+1,l}(x) + x^4P_2(x) = 0
$$

for some polynomials  $P_1, P_2 \in \mathbb{Q}[x]$ , depending on  $l, m, n$ .

By Lemma [4.3](#page-4-3) (and the fact that  $m > l+1$ ) the polynomial  $4mA_{m+1,n}A_{-m+1,l} + x^4P_1$  is not zero. Hence, in case it vanishes at the point  $x_0$  we get that  $x_0$  is algebraic. Otherwise, using the preceding equation to eliminate  $F_{m+1}$  from the first equation in [\(4\)](#page-5-4) leads to an equation of the form

$$
16m4Am+1,n(x0)3A-m+1,l(x0)2 + x04P3(x0) = 0
$$

with  $P_3 \in \mathbb{Q}[x]$  depending on  $l, m, n$ . From Lemma [4.3](#page-4-3) it follows that  $x_0$  is algebraic in this case too.

We have shown that  $x_0$  is algebraic. However, this is impossible, as by the Siegel-Shidlovskii theory all positive roots of  $W_m(x) = 0$  are transcendental (see [\[2,](#page-6-3) cor. 6.4]).  $\Box$ 

### References

<span id="page-5-0"></span>[1] R. Courant and D. Hilbert. *Methods of mathematical physics. Vol. I*. Interscience Publishers, Inc., New York, 1953, pp. xv+561.

- <span id="page-6-3"></span>[2] Y. Lvovsky and D. Mangoubi. "Bounded multiplicity for eigenvalues of a circular vibrating clamped plate". In: J. Differential Geom. 121.2 (2022), pp. 369–383. issn: 0022-040X,1945- 743X. DOI: [10.4310/jdg/1659987895](https://doi.org/10.4310/jdg/1659987895).
- <span id="page-6-0"></span>[3] C. L. Siegel. "Über einige Anwendungen diophantischer Approximationen." German. In: Abh. Preuß. Akad. Wiss., Phys.-Math. Kl. 1929.1 (1929), 70 s.
- <span id="page-6-1"></span>[4] C. L. Siegel. Transcendental Numbers. Vol. No. 16. Annals of Mathematics Studies. Princeton University Press, Princeton, NJ, 1949, pp. viii+102.
- <span id="page-6-2"></span>[5] G. N. Watson. A treatise on the theory of Bessel functions. Cambridge Mathematical Library. Reprint of the second (1944) edition. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1995, pp. viii+804. isbn: 0-521-48391-3.

Einstein Institute of Mathematics, Edmond J. Safra Campus, The Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Jerusalem 9190401, Israel Email address: dan.mangoubi@mail.huji.ac.il

Einstein Institute of Mathematics, Edmond J. Safra Campus, The Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Jerusalem 9190401, Israel Email address: daniel.rosenblatt2@mail.huji.ac.il